Adaptation of HTA reports: an effective way to use limited resources?

Iñaki Gutiérrez-Ibarluzea,
Osteba, Basque Office for HTA. Ministry for Health, Basque Government
Introducing the Basque Country

Basque Country/Euskadi
Key facts and figures about the Basque Country

- 2.1 million population, in 7.235 Km²
- 2 official languages, Spanish and Basque
- Fiscal and financial autonomy: Fiscal legislation, tax collection and administration powers.
- Highest Human Development Index (HDI, United Nations) in Spain –taking into account a mix of social welfare indicators.
- Wealthiest region in Spain
- European average in R&D (>2% of GDP)
- Export-oriented economy, ca 30% GDP is industry-derived

Source: “Euskadi in Figures,” Lehendakaritza, EUSTAT
Key facts and figures about the Basque Country Health System

- Universal health system
- Financed by taxes on the basis of the Beveridge model
- Governed by the principles of **universality, equity, solidarity, quality** and **participation**
- Free access to the system for residents in the Basque Country
- Each citizen is attached to a doctor in his or her place of residence
- Active workforce > 34.500 (>25.800 structural staff)

Source: “Euskadi in Figures,” Lehendakaritza, EUSTAT
Some health indicators

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Life expectancy at birth</td>
<td>2nd world place for women 85.3 y. 7th for men 79 y.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Birth rate</td>
<td>9.7 per 1,000 inhabitants 21,000 live births per year</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child mortality rate</td>
<td>4 per th. births. Lower than UK, Germany, Denmark, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mother’s mortality</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Causes of mortality in general population</td>
<td>similar to western countries</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ageing population</td>
<td>20% ≥ 65 years of age (2020 estimations: 24-26%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In first places for donations of organ transplants

Donation rate 2011: 45.8 / PMP (per million population)

Average donations in the past 10 years: 40/PMP threshold (maximum possible donors per million population, according to WHO)
Department of Health (Basque Government): structure

- Minister for Health
  - Head of Legal, Economic and General Services
  - Vice minister of Health
  - Head of Minister’s cabinet
    - Healthcare Planning, Management and Evaluation
    - Health Research and Innovation
    - Territorial Administrations
  - Public Health and Addictions
  - Hiring and health assurance
  - Pharmacy
Healthcare System organisation

The Basque Country holds Health planning powers and the capacity to organize its own health services.
Who we are...

• Basque Office for HTA, **Osteba**, created in 1992.
• **SorTek**, early awareness and alert system established in 2000
• Founder members of INAHTA, EuroScan, GIN, AUnETS, EUnetHTA
• Members of INAHTA, HTAi and EUnetHTA
• In 2004: Regulatory law (not drugs) for the introduction of new and emerging health technologies and disinvestment of existing ineffective, no cost-effective or harmful ones
• In 2009: **ZaharTek**, network for the identification of obsolete technologies
• Promoters of the HTAi ISG on disinvestment 2010
• Promoters of the HTAi ISG on EAAS
• Organizers of HTAi 2012
How many...

• 4 people staff (including head of Unit)
• 6 senior researchers
  – one information specialists
  – One expert in ICTs
• 2 administrative and project management officers
• Part of the Basque Ministry of Health
What to do with scarce resources?

- De novo or adapted
- When?
- Characteristics of HTA reports
- Algorithm for decisions
- Quality of recovered HTA reports
- Adapt / adopt / “de novo”
- Relevance / reliability / transferability
- Lessons learnt
State of the art

- HTA is a multidisciplinary process that summarizes information about the medical, social, economic, legal and ethical issues related to the use of a health technology in a systematic, transparent, unbiased, robust manner.
What should require an adapted HTA report?

• HTA reports or other sources of information
• When should be decide on starting a HTA report from scratch or adapt a report elaborated by others?
When? The life cycle concept...

(Modified from Gutiérrez-Ibarluzea and Dauben, 2013)
The HTA report (I)

- Health problem description
- Description and characteristics of the health technology to be assessed and SOC.
- Methodology
  - Information selection criteria
  - Research strategy
  - Critical appraisal of the evidence and quality
  - Evidence synthesis
HTA report (II)

• Evidence available
  – Search outcomes
  – Description and quality of retrieved reports
• Clinical outcomes
• Implementation issues
  – Economic issues
  – Organizational aspects
  – Legal, ethical and social issues
What to do?

- Recently published report on rapid assessments and adaptation
- Joint action of the Spanish HTA network
- Supported by the Spanish Ministry for health
- Part of the methodological tools
Identificación de necesidades en el SNS

Planificación del informe de evaluación

¿Existe algún informe de ETS con la misma pregunta de investigación?

- Identificación ≥1 informe
- Ningún informe identificado

Síntesis de novo

Uso de la herramienta de adaptación

- Evaluación de su relevancia (Speedy sifting)
- Evaluación de fiabilidad y posibilidad de transferir (Main toolkit)

Obtención de información fiável y transferible

Adaptación de la información fiável y transferible

El material adaptado se incorpora a un informe de ETS nacional/regional para lo que se requiere la incorporación de información adicional

PRODUCTO FINAL:
Informe de ETS para ámbito nacional/regional que contiene información adaptada

Ningún informe ni ninguno de sus dominios es relevante

Algún informe o alguno de sus dominios es relevante

Ningún informe ni ninguno de sus dominios es fiável y/o transferible
Analyse the quality of HTA retrieved reports

- Reliable sources
  - Members of INAHTA, EUnetHTA, HTAsialink, REDETS, EuroScan...
- Updated
- Methodological quality analysis
  - INAHTA Checklist
ADAPT / ADOPT or DE NOVO

• To verify the relevance of the retrieved report to our report’s question or questions
• To identify the information that is relevant and feasible to be transferred to the context to be applied
• To evaluate the reliability of the information;
• To identify the issue or issues that can occur when transferring the retrieved information to the local context;
• To decide how to solve those problems.
Main issues

- **Relevance**: the question or inquiry questions of the report or reports that we retrieve must be sufficiently similar to the one of the report that is being carried out to guarantee its possible adaptation **Utility or Usefulness**
- **Reliability**: A HTA report is reliable when its users can rely on the results. If this is the case, consideration should be given to their adaptation or adoption; **Internal validity**
- **Transferability**: possibility of transferring information: this is the ability to apply the information collected in a HTA report into another context. **External validity**
  - It is divided into safety and effectiveness
Transferability

• Safety
  – Is the population described in the report alike to the target population in our context?
  – Is there any reason to expect differences in complication rates (e.g., epidemiological, genetic, health system-related, quality of care, surveillance)?
  – Are the requirements for the use of technology (special measures for use, implementation, maintenance, or other needs) available in the new context?
  – Does safety depend especially on training? Are there any groups in which the procedure should be limited for safety reasons? Do you need special training or certification to perform the intervention properly? Would it be acceptable or supported in the new context to develop the required training or capacity building, if required?
Transferability

- Effectiveness:
  - Would you expect the baseline risk of the patients in your own environment to be the same as that of the patients considered in the HTA report to adapt? (Assuming patients receive the same treatment and the comparator is also the same).
  - Problems could be related to the SOCs
Main challenges

- Internal validity
- External Validity
- Transferability
  - Safety
  - Effectiveness
  - Health System
Our experience...

- What are the opportunities and challenges of adapting HTA reports produced elsewhere to the local health system?
- What has worked well (or not so well) in adaptation experiences?
- Are some HTA reports (or parts of reports) better suited for adaptation than others?
- What skills or capacities are needed to adapt HTA reports successfully?
What are the opportunities and challenges of adapting HTA reports produced elsewhere to the local health system?

- Should be a mandate
- Efficiency, avoiding duplication
- Should be systematic and iterative
- Transparent and robust

CADTH, 2015
What has worked well (or not so well) in adaptation experiences?

- Easier in the case of certain technologies (drugs,...)
- Transferability is challenge in surgical procedures and public health initiatives
- Stakeholder involvement
- Health care system knowledge
- It is not just... HTA analysis
Are some HTA reports (or parts of reports) better suited for adaptation than others?

- Core (safety and efficacy)
- More difficulties when compliance, adherence, ELSOI...
- Health care and professional characteristics
- Society
- Qualitative research required
What skills or capacities are needed to adapt HTA reports successfully?

- Checklists useful but...
- Need to know the characteristics and way of implementing decisions
- Knowledge on health care system, its structure and processes, its professionals and the characteristics of the population
- It is not pure ... HTA
A very recent experience
Technology for the treatment of dysmetria or achondroplasia

- Safety and efficacy of a new prosthesis for limb lengthening in children with limb dysmetria or achondroplasia.
- New technology
- A HTA report found from CADTH, 2017
  - Seek for permission (obtained)
  - Update, adaptation to our context
Main challenges

• Not a full HTA (new technology)
• PICO question
• Relevance, reliability and transferability
• Different regulatory requirements
  – Canada and Europe
• Organizational aspects
• Social consequences
• Ethical and legal aspects
Q&A
You have Questions We have Answers